

## Resilience, Alienation and Female Friendship: Resilient Women in Toni Morrison's 'Paradise' and Khaled Hosseini's 'A Thousand Splendid Suns'

Azha Farid, Rabia Tufail and Shabbir Ahmad

Department of English, University of Sahiwal, Pakistan

### ARTICLE INFO

#### ARTICLE HISTORY

Received: February 16, 2023

Accepted: March 21, 2023

Published: March 30, 2023

#### KEYWORDS

*Patriarchal society;*

*Struggling women;*

*Alienation;*

*Female friendship;*

*Resilience*

### ABSTRACT

This study explores the resilience of women, their alienation (spiritual or physical detachment from others), and the use of female bonding as a tool of resilience in Toni Morrison's *Paradise* and Khaled Hosseini's *A Thousand Splendid Suns*. The theoretical framework includes the Alienation Theory by Charles Reitz (2000), the Resilience Theory by Luthans et al. (2006) and the concept of Female Friendship by Elizabeth Abel (1981). The wearisome experience of the women in both of these novels is such a situation that they form mutual connections to compensate for the loss of mother/father love, face harsh social circumstances, and fight against the challenges created by gender differences. Female friendship becomes a powerful tool that helps women in combatting patriarchal oppression and a weapon of struggle to be free from societal pressures which give them a sense that they are objects. Toni Morrison's *Paradise*, by portraying the failure of women's relationships, exposes the ubiquitous power of patriarchy and relevant challenges. Even then, there is a spiritual kind of optimism that the death of women is in fact a future prediction of women's freedom from patriarchy. Similarly, Khaled Hosseini ends *A Thousand Splendid Suns* on an optimistic note that a woman builds a home for abandoned and deserted women. Thus the women show resilience in hard times by making mutual bonds and then struggling for liberation. It signifies that both of these writers have affiliations with feminist ideals of women's liberation. This study lays the foundation for further research in resilience studies in combination with alienation and female friendship in these novelists.

Corresponding Author: Shabbir Ahmad (Email: [shabbirahmad@uosahiwal.edu.pk](mailto:shabbirahmad@uosahiwal.edu.pk))

### INTRODUCTION

Toni Morrison (1931-2019), a renowned black female fiction writer, has written ten major novels including *The Bluest Eye* (1970), *Beloved* (1987) and *Home* (2012). She has presented mostly the black issues, but the universal appeal of her works is undeniable. Critical studies on her fiction reveal many critical standpoints: Race issues, Marxist approaches, comparative literature, and psychological investigations. The current study brings into focus Morrison's novel *Paradise* (1998). Khaled Hosseini (born in 1965) is an Afghan-American writer. His three major novels are: *The Kite Runner* (2003), *A Thousand Splendid Suns* (2007), and *The Mountains Echoed* (2013). He sketches a picture of Afghanistan and its people in his novels. His novels explore the effects of war on people, environment, and their mutual relationship. The present study analyses his second novel *A Thousand Splendid Suns* (2007) in which he highlights the ways by which women struggle to cope with patriarchal norms and a continuous war environment. This study explores women's alienation, resilience, and friendship in both novels.

The concept of alienation has its associations in philosophy, economics, psychology, sociology, and literary studies. Alienation is an experience or the feeling of being an "alien" or detached from one's self, from others, from one's work and from one's own creations/products. Alienation is defined in different ways in different disciplines of knowledge and appears under different names such as estrangement, detachment and isolation. Alienation is a significant state of life in the discussion of literary works (Scott, 1952). The writers Homer, William Shakespeare, James Joyce, T. S. Eliot and Albert Camus have presented the idea of alienation in their works (Morrison, 1955). The researcher believes that the concept of alienation, significantly analyzed in fictional works, can give readers useful insights about African American women in America and Afghan women in Afghanistan. This study has been connected with the concepts of female friendship and resilience.

Resilience is the capacity to recover quickly from difficulties. It is the ability to bounce back in the face of adversity. Resilience means an active process of self-righting, learned resourcefulness, and growth. The concept relates to "the ability to function at a higher level psychologically based on an individual's capabilities and previous experience" (Paton et al., 2000, p.5379). Resilience makes one recover from or adjust well in response to adverse circumstances. It requires understanding a situation, identifying adaptation strategies, and organization of resilience in different

challenging situations. When individuals face stress in disturbing scenarios, the resilience can help them to make the outcome positive. Resilience is the capacity to recover quickly from difficulties (Coutu, 2002). It gives ability to a person to survive in depressing situation and provides experience for future to survive if such situation is created again. Resilience plays a significant role in one's life and helps to withstand external pressures which push an individual to isolation and alienation.

This study correlates alienation with resilience shown by struggling women in combating various pressures and challenges in a society with strong patriarchal forces in work. One impact of the social pressures is the creation of alienation from others, which deals with mutual cooperation among women. Female bonding is a powerful connection among women to fight against alienation, oppressive societal forces, and values. Women friends provide moral support with the mindset of caring for each other beyond the concern for self or family. Hence it is an endeavor to help and elevate each other as "there are other channels, such as writing and sisterhood" (Nnaemeka, 1997, p.19). The women's bonding becomes indispensable throughout their struggle against oppressive forces, since they suffer from the negative impact of the discriminating cultural forces. In *Paradise* and *A Thousand Splendid Suns*, both Morrison and Hosseini bring into lime light the destructive and overwhelming influence of patriarchy on women by drawing on the fact that alienation arises when social pressures make an individual an object with no will of his/her own. In these works, both of the writers present those female characters that undergo a struggle to gain control over their world by forming mutual bonds following Virginia Woolf's idea of having her own owned place to live as given in *A Room of One's Own* (1929) and show resilience under harsh social circumstances.

Many critical studies have been done on the two novels under discussion here. Widdowson discusses *Paradise* with the view that the men attack on "women because they were women" (2001). Krumholz explores "cultural hybridity" (2002) of the women in a convent, while Schur discusses it with the perspective of the Post-Civil Rights Era and Critical Race Theory (2004). Mayberry explores mysticism and duality in *Paradise* (2008). Dobbs analyses it from the perspective of Diasporic designs (2011) and Tapley (2013) declares it Toni Morrison's Anti-capitalist Production. Jamil et al. (2021) study sisterhood in *Paradise*, which is also being discussed in the current study, but it is combined with alienation and resilience. Similarly, the critical works on *A Thousand Splendid Suns* are numerous. Rüsse & Krasnova (2019) have worked on the concept of women as a trickster in it. Pondelíková (2021) discusses the identity problem of women, while Zubair (2021) explores Afghanistan's history, culture, and tradition while Yeasmin & Islam (2021) discuss the concept of parenthood. Moreover, Yasin et al. (2021) evaluate the endurance of subalterns using Spivak's concept of subalternity.

In the already done research works, as mentioned above, on Khaled Hosseini and Toni Morrison, a lot is written on gender, patriarchy, ethnicity, racism, war, civil war, but the idea of resilience remains unexplored in greater depth, especially in a comparative framework and in combination with alienation and female friendship. This research gap still needs to be filled, which is endeavored in this current study and the researcher intends to explore it from women perspective. Women form mutual bonds to exhibit resilience against gender discrimination and unjust patriarchal oppressions. First, they show a high degree of resilience, but when the cruelties and injustice reach an unbearable scale, they become resistant without caring for their lives. In the present study, we explore the connection between alienation, resilience and female friendship in *Paradise* and *A Thousand Splendid Suns*.

#### **Research Questions:**

1. Which social norms and practices make women alienated from personal and social relations in *Paradise* and *A Thousand Splendid Suns*?
2. How do Morrison and Hosseini portray the resilience of women as a tool to survive against injustices and discriminatory patriarchal practices?
3. How does female friendship develop and help women in exhibiting resilience against oppressive forces in these works?

#### **THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK**

Alienation is considered a mode of human life in which a person undergoes an experience of being an alien (outsider); an estrangement from one's own self, society, or work. This concept is originally derived from Karl Marx who is read not as an economist but a philosopher on alienation. Karl Marx bases his concept of alienation on the concrete economic foundation labor's realization of its objectification in the work process. The worker is related to the product of his labor as to an alien object (1844). For the use of Marx's concept in literary studies, Charles Reitz cites quotes Herbert Marcuse: "It is thus a matter of man as man and of a process not only in economic history but in the history of man" (quoted in Reitz, 2000, pp.7-8). Thus, according to Herbert Marcuse, alienation results internally from the human mind, and subject-object dichotomy creates an alienation in any human or social interaction. Thus, the major factor that brings alienation is the feeling of being an object instead of having the subject position. The women characters in Morrison's *Paradise* and Khaled Hosseini's *A Thousand Splendid Suns* lose subject positions and undergo alienation. To endure this alienation and adjust in a depressing social environment, a need for resilience is created in an individual.

Resilience is defined as the developable capacity to rebound from adversity (Luthans et al., 2006). It implies that it is a capacity that is not inborn but developed by the will of a person growing up in a certain environment. The challenging environments have different effects on people: some just accept the defeat, but some keep on struggling to achieve a certain position where they can exercise their agency. Bhamra et al. (2011, p.5376) contend, "the concept of resilience is closely related to the capability and ability of an element to return to a stable state after a disruption. Resilience is therefore related to both the individual and collective responses to turbulence". Thus it is not only an individual act but also a collective deed when individuals come together and make the group as a union facilitates to be resilient in a challenging situation. This union is called female friendship by critics.

Female friendship is a useful force according to many theorists. Elizabeth Abel declares women's friendship a force "to give form, expression, and reality to the ways in which women have been for our Selves and each other" (Abel, 1981, p. 434). Hudson-Weems (1998, p. 65) defines it as an "asexual relationship for enjoying, understanding, and supporting each other". Thus, female friendship is a non-sexual bonding by nature based on caring and sharing. Dubek (2001, p. 212) connects female friendship with the African feminism: "in defining an African feminist literary tradition, critics highlight female friendship and women's solidarity" and Morrison's *Paradise* does the same but presenting certain challenges faced by such connections. She highlights the complexities and problems of women relationships. Such a union is also found in Khaled Hosseini's *A Thousand Splendid Suns*. This study correlates women friendship with resilience shown by struggling women as a tool for combating various pressures such as alienation and other similar challenges in a society with strong patriarchal oppressive forces in work.

The women in both novels realize that a sure way to deal with marginalization and alienation is to make a strong bond with one another. The women have started to understand that the men are not trustworthy as the mother Nana tells her daughter Mariam in *A Thousand Splendid Suns* "a man's accusing finger always finds a woman" (Hosseini, 2003, p. 7). She adds, "A man's heart is a wretched thing. It isn't like a mother's womb" (p.27), which clearly hints at not believing on men but look beyond for something else, such as making friends with other females for survival in a male-dominated world. The next-generation girl Laila believes what her fiancé Tariq has said to her "Marriage can wait Education cannot. You can be anything you want Laila" (p.114). However, the circumstances push her to an early marriage. She has to suffer the hardships after marriage like many other women as Mariam has once spoken "How quietly we endure all that falls upon us." (p.91). It shows the resilience present in Afghan women to endure all the hardships and survive. The writer mentions Afghan women's resilience: "every Afghan story is marked by death and loss and unimaginable grief. And yet, she sees, people find a way to survive" (p.395). Similarly, we see the women come to make a union of themselves in Morrison's *Paradise* as the women wonder "But why were there no stories to tell of themselves?" (p.4). Soane declares it is a great mistake to presume that the wedding would bring comfort: "The peace and goodwill summoned by the announcement of the marriage were now shattered" (p.154). They start thinking for "A Room of One's Own" (Woolf, 1929) when one of the girls Connie says "But can't you even imagine what it must feel like to have a true home?" where "no one to bother or insult them" (p.8). But the men declare the women living in a separate place as "Bodacious black Eves" (p.18) and kill them all. However, their death becomes an emblem of endurance and resilience.

## DISCUSSION

### **Resilience, Alienation and Female Friendship in *Paradise***

The novel *Paradise*, published in 1998, by Toni Morrison is a story of a group of African Americans who seek refuge in a racist society and establish a segregated town (Ruby) of black people. Morrison's novels are often about race, class, and gender and, in *Paradise*, these three aspects are interconnected. It is often said that Toni Morrison's *Paradise* is written to shed light on the dark history of slavery and racism. Furthermore, it brings fore gender issues such as violence against women and the resilience of women against odds within black societies. In some studies on Morrison, the patriarchal operations are linked with poverty (Ahmad et al., 2021); however, in *Paradise*, the birth right of the superiority of men over women is challenged. Toni Morrison wants to show how difficult it has been for African-American women to live an independent life in a hierarchal black community. She shows that women have the capacity of resilience and try their best to survive with dignity in a challenging environment. Facing patriarchal discrimination and oppression, the Ruby women form mutual bonds for survival and start living in a separate building called a Convent. The Convent women develop mutual friendships to resist patriarchal oppression and discriminatory constraints. However, such a sisterhood suffers a setback and brings more conflicts between women with men around. First, a female friendship develops in the process of combating outside pressures, and then this friendship is challenged, which demands a higher degree of resilience. They remain strong-willed, determined and resilient in their struggle for liberty and freedom. However, men become furious at the boldness of women and attack them, thus bringing the death of all the segregated women in Convent. Their lives are ended, but resilience is not lost till the end.

The death of the female characters in this novel symbolizes the lifelong struggle of women and the longing for freedom from oppression and resultant alienation. Toni Morrison conveys the sad fact that women, even in the convent, are

not free from the interruption of Ruby's males. But she emphasizes the point that women should have hope and struggle to survive with dignity in a challenging environment. She has always emphasized "Black Lives Matter" (Jamil et al., 2021). However, not only black man's life but black woman's life also matters. The death and disappearance of the dead bodies of the women in this novel is a sort of counter-story. It is a story not of defeat but the story of a longing for survival with a ray of hope for independence in the future. Richard Delgado calls such counter stories that "can show us the way out of the trap of unjustified exclusion. They can help us understand when it is time to reallocate power" (2013). In fact, such kind of storytelling is a powerful means for creating meanings as well as challenging the accepted premises or myths, particularly those held by the majority (Delgado & Stefancic, 1995, p.144). The death of females is not just a happening but also a useful message. Morrison uses death as a way to convey to readers the troubles and pain that women have to face in their lives in patriarchal societies. Thus, she emphasizes "redefining Americanism" (Ahmad et al., 2021) where women are given equal freedom and a life of their own will rather than a life of imposition of will by men. Similarly, Khaled Hosseini calls for a redefinition of Afghans through his stories where women can have equal social status to men.

### **Resilience, Alienation and Female Friendship in *A Thousand Splendid Suns***

*A Thousand Splendid Suns* by Khaled Hosseini presents three generations of women whose lives are influenced by war and patriarchal oppression in Afghanistan of 1960s to 1990s. It brings to the fore women's search for true love, real family life and caring relationships. However, when family relations treat women as objects, they feel alienated from all relations. Nana is a woman who has opened her eyes in a male-dominated social environment. Her life is the reflection of the unfair treatment of women in Afghan society and discrimination on the basis of gender roles. Here we see gender inequality (Safdar, Hashim, & Alzahrvi, 2022) which paves the way for rebellion and resistance in females of a patriarchal society. She lives with her daughter in a small cottage. Her bitterness shows the effect of unjust male dominance over women. Jalil, her husband, wants a boy, but a girl Maryam is born to Nana, over which Jalil feels ashamed and heartbroken. Maryam is considered an illegitimate child as her father does not openly declare his marriage to Nana. Nana warns her daughter, "she has no one in this society except her mother". Here we find echoes of the voices of the oppressed (Safdar, Abbas, & Zafar, 2022) which can no longer remain oppressed but become voices heard. She tells her daughter that her father's family considers them outsiders, and when Maryam goes to search for her father, Nana attempts suicide and her death changes Maryam. She feels alone and alienated from the people and world around her. Although she considers herself the cause of her mother's death, she remains determined to live with resilience in an environment of female oppression.

Maryam is married to Rasheed who believes in controlling and restricting women. Maryam's life situation is a strong critique of the patriarchal social norms of Afghan society. Mariam understands as Nana has endured the cruel practices of the patriarchal society, she has to follow the same path and spend her life with resilience under societal constraints. Maryam as an oppressed woman is a victim of the societal discrimination and violence of her husband but then she interacts with Laila. Laila is a strong-willed girl who does not accept life as confined by traditions. She has grown up in such an environment where her father has always favored female independence. This makes her a strong character with strong beliefs and values. However, the irony of fate is that after her parents' sudden deaths in war, she has to marry Rasheed. Her mutual friendship with Maryam provides strength to both. After the death of Laila's parents, Laila suffers from parental hunger (Ahmad et al., 2020) but Maryam fills this gap. Laila consistently tries to find an exit from Rasheed's shackles. Rasheed learns about the plan of Laila and Maryam to free Laila and starts beating them with a belt. When Laila tries to resist, Rasheed comes to strangle her and Laila is just going to die. Maryam, at that time, manages to support Laila and kills Rasheed to save Laila. Rasheed's male dominance and cruel actions make Maryam and Laila fearless, bold and strong. Maryam proves to be a mother figure to Laila. Her sacrifice for Laila does not leave Laila to be parentless always. Maryam satisfies her parental hunger and ends her alienation through physical and spiritual attachment to her even after her death. The life stories of these women become sources of resistance for the future and the resilience shown by them is exemplary (Imran et al., 2017).

The author conveys the story of two women who are married to the same man and how they cope with their abusive husbands. Their friendship makes them strong and resilient in dangerous circumstances. Like Nana they do not adopt a life of alienation and do not attempt suicide. Taliban capture Maryam and stone her to death in the case of murdering her husband, Rasheed. The ending conveys to the readers that Khaled Hosseini is still optimistic about women's emancipation in the future. The story's ending is happy, with Laila's union with her lost husband Tariq and her family reunion. Later they return to Afghanistan and construct an orphanage where small deserted children can develop female friendships and resilience against social restrictions. The women are treated as "colonized subaltern" by Afghan men; however, the resilience of women and resistance is a sort of counter-story which is an "enabling violation" of the "colonized," which stimulates subaltern group to convert "conditions of impossibility into possibility" (Spivak, 1988).

## CONCLUSION

Both novels present women who feel alienated due to oppression under patriarchy. Their stories portray their resilience in facing life's challenges under pressure, but they do so in different ways. In *Paradise*, the women are killed when they detach themselves from the males of Ruby and establish an isolated Convent for living together as sisters. These women, in reality, fly to heaven after the murder. It shows no paradise for women where they can live freely in such societies. In *A Thousand Splendid Suns*, a woman sacrifices her life for the protection of another female thus practically proving the sincerity of the female friendship in their struggle against patriarchy. They remain resilient and show extraordinary courage in the struggle restriction free life. The resistant narrative of these stories declares men as responsible for violence, conflicts and distress among women. Disenfranchised, marginalized, suppressed, and exploited women are forced to resist in order to make their voices heard and recognized. It signifies that "decolonization of masculine" is necessary to make an end to the feelings of isolation and alienation among females in societies. It highlights that both of these writers promote feministic ideals of women's liberation and independence for a life of one's own will. This study paves the way for further research in the field of resilience studies in combination with alienation and female friendship.

## REFERENCES

- Abbas, S., Hashim, M., & Alzuhairi, A. A. M. (2018). Status of Rural Women: Patriarchy and Inevitability of Subjugation; A Study of Rural Area in Multan, Pakistan. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 9(6), 107-114.
- Abel, E. (1981). (E) Merging Identities: The Dynamics of Female Friendship in Contemporary Fiction by Women. *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society*, 6(3), 413-435.
- Ahmad, S., Chaudhary, F., & Murtaza, G. (2020). Parental Hunger and Alienation in Toni Morrison's *The Bluest Eye*. *International Review of Literary Studies*, 2(1), 39-45.
- Ahmad, S., Mahmood, M. I., & Mobeen, M. (2020). Redefining Americanism and American Literary Tradition: Hospitality, Ethics and A Transcendent Humanism in Cormac McCarthy's Fiction. *Pakistan Social Sciences Review*, 4(1), 849-861
- Ahmed, S., Mushtaq, M., & Chauhdari, F. (2021). A Study of Alienation in Toni Morrison's *Love: Poverty, Patriarchal Institution of Marriage and Female Friendship*. *Journal of English Language, Literature and Education*, 2(03), 53-62.
- Bhamra, R., Dani, S., & Burnard, K. (2011). Resilience: the concept, a literature review and future directions. *International journal of production research*, 49(18), 5375-5393.
- Coutu, D. L. (2002). How Resilience Works. *Harvard Business Review*, 80 (5), 46-56.
- Delgado, R. (1989). Storytelling for Oppositionists and Others: A Plea for Narrative. *Michigan law review*, 87(8), 2411-2441. [https://scholarship.law.ua.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1374&context=fac\\_articles](https://scholarship.law.ua.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1374&context=fac_articles)
- Delgado, R., & Stefancic, J. (2012). *Critical Race Theory: An Introduction*. 2001. *New York: New York UP*.
- Dobbs, C. (2011). Diasporic Designs of House, Home, and Haven in Toni Morrison's *Paradise*. *MELUS*, 36( 2), 109-126
- Dubek, L. (2001). Lessons in Solidarity: Buchi Emecheta and Mariama Bâ on Female Victim (izer)s. *Women's Studies: An Interdisciplinary Journal*, 30(2), 199-223
- Hosseini, K. (2003). *The Kite Runner*. Riverhead Books.
- Hosseini, K. (2007). *A Thousand Splendid Suns*. Riverhead Books.
- Hosseini, K. (2013). *And The Mountains Echoed*. Riverhead Books.
- Hudson-Weems, C. (1998). *Africana Womanism: Reclaiming Ourselves*. 1993. *Troy, MI: Bedford Publishers Inc*.
- Jamil, M. B., Khan, M. A., & Ahmad, S. (2021). Black Lives Matter: Critical Analysis of McCarthy's *The Road* (2006) in the Backdrop of George Floyd's Murder. *Research Journal of Social Sciences and Economics Review*, 2(2), 444-449.
- Jamil, M. B., Khan, M. A., & Ahmad, D. S. (2021). Women can be Destroyed but Not Defeated: Undefeatable Struggle of Sisters in Toni Morrison's *Paradise*. *Pakistan Social Sciences Review*, 5(3), 28-39. [http://doi.org/10.35484/pssr.2021\(5-III\)04](http://doi.org/10.35484/pssr.2021(5-III)04)
- Joyia, M. I., Farooq, U., Ghafoor, S. & Gull, A. (2017). Courageous Women: A Study of Resilience of Women in Khaled Hosseini's Novel *A Thousand Splendid Suns*. *Language in India*, 17(1), 98-108.
- Krumholz, L. J. (2002). Reading and insight in Toni Morrison's *Paradise*. *African American Review*, 36(1), 21-34.
- Luthans, F., Vogelgesang, G. R., & Lester, P. B. (2006). Developing the psychological capital of resiliency. *Human resource development review*, 5(1), 25-44.
- Marx, K. (1932). *Economic & Philosophic Manuscripts of 1844*. Prometheus Books
- Mayberry, S. N. (2008). Everything About Her Had Two Sides to It": The Foreigner's Home in Toni Morrison's *Paradise*. *African American Review*, 42(3/4), 565-578.
- Morrison, T. (1970). *The Bluest Eye*. Pocket Books
- Morrison, T. (1987). *Beloved*. Alfred A. Knopf
- Morrison, T. (1998). *Paradise*. Vintage
- Morrison, T. (2012). *Home*. Alfred A. Knopf
- Morrison, T. (1955). *Virginia Woolf's and William Faulkner's Treatment of the Alienated*. Thesis. Cornell University

- Nnaemeka, O. (1997) Introduction: Imag (in) ing Knowledge, Power, and Subversion in the Margins. The Politics of (M) othering: Womanhood, Identity, and Resistance in African Literature. Ed. Obioma Nnaemeka London: Routledge, p. 1-26.
- Paton, D., Smith, L., and Violanti, J. (2000). Disaster response: Risk, Vulnerability and Resilience. *Disaster Prevention and Management*, 9 (3), 173-180.
- Pondelíková, I. (2021). The Afghan Identity Reflected in A Thousand Splendid Suns by Khaled Hosseini. *Academia Letters*, Article 816. <https://doi.org/10.20935/AL816>
- Reitz, C. (2000). *Art, Alienation, and the Humanities: A Critical Engagement with Herbert Marcuse*. State University of New York Press. <https://philpapers.org/rec/REIAAA-4>
- Rüsse, P., & Krasnova, A. (2019). Pro-Social Trickstars in Khaled Hosseini's A Thousand Splendid Suns. *Interlitteraria*, 24(2), 556-576. <https://doi.org/10.12697/IL.2019.24.2.21>
- Safdar, A., Abbas, S., & ul Zafar, N. (2022). Tracing the Voices of the Oppressed: A Reading of Bapsi Sidhwa's Novel 'The Pakistani Bride'. *Journal of Social Sciences Advancement*, 3(3), 186-192. <https://doi.org/10.52223/JSSA22-030310-46>
- Schur, R. L. (2004). Locating "Paradise" in the Post-Civil Rights Era: Toni Morrison and Critical Race Theory. *Contemporary Literature*, 45(2), 276-299
- Scott, N. A. (1952). *Rehearsals of discomposure: Alienation and reconciliation in modern literature: Franz Kafka, Ignazio Silone, D.H. Lawrence [and] T.S. Eliot*. John Lehmann.
- Spivak, G. C. (1988). Can the Subaltern Speak? In C. Nelson & L. Grossberg (Eds.), *Marxism and the Interpretation of Culture*. Basingstoke: MacMillan Education
- Tapley, H. (2013). Queering Paradise: Toni Morrison's Anti-capitalist Production. *Feminist Theory*, 14(1), 21-37
- Widdowson, P. (2001). "The American Dream Refashioned: History, Politics and Gender in Toni Morrison's Paradise." *Journal of American Studies* 35(2), 313-335
- Woolf, V. (1929). *A Room of One's Own*. Harcourt, Brace and Company. [http://seas3.elte.hu/coursematerial/PikliNatalia/Virginia\\_Woolf\\_-\\_A\\_Room\\_of\\_Ones\\_Own.pdf](http://seas3.elte.hu/coursematerial/PikliNatalia/Virginia_Woolf_-_A_Room_of_Ones_Own.pdf)
- Yasin, G., Waqar, S., Javed, N., & Naem, A. (2021) Endurance of the Subaltern: A Study of a Thousand Splendid Suns by Khaled Hosseini. *Humanities & Social Sciences Reviews*, 9 (3), 745-753
- Yeasmin, F., & Islam, S. (2021). The Concept of Parenthood in Khaled Hosseini's *The Kite Runner* and *A Thousand Splendid Suns*. *Journal of Critical Studies in Language and Literature*, 2(6), 19-27
- Zubair, A. (2021). Afghanistan: History, Culture, and Tradition in *A Thousand Splendid Suns*. *Research Journal of English Language and Literature*, 9(3), 198-204